

Rusudan Tsanava (Tbilisi)

### 'CRETAN' ODYSSEUS

The *Odyssey* is rightly recognized as a powerful resource for European literary images. It is no exaggeration to say that Odysseus as a character has attracted an unparalleled number of researchers. Even so, the text offers a lot more nuances and perspectives to be explored and thought over. In the *Iliad* Odysseus appears in several key episodes; however, the epic makes no mention of his most significant accomplishments in the Trojan War. If but for Achilles the Greeks would not have been able to prevail over the main pillar of Troy, Hector, they would have failed to enter Troy without Odysseus. This feat of Odysseus is foregrounded in the first four books of the *Odyssey*. The textual analysis of the so-called 'Wooden Horse' episode reveals that the poet employs reiteration – tells the same story several (three) times with different interpretations.<sup>1</sup> At present it is impossible to say who introduced the artistic device of reiteration in epic; we cannot argue about pre-Homeric literature, while following the Homeric epics, repetition of central stories in a sizeable epic, with some episodes reduced or extended, is a widely practiced artistic device.<sup>2</sup>

Odysseus often lies. His lies can be grouped in a certain way: he lies to rescue himself and his friends (for example, with Polyphemus); his lies are motivated by caution (e. g. with the Phaeacians).

Now let us consider one of Odysseus' lies, which in my opinion, has a very interesting, deep explanation. Odysseus, back to Ithaca, recounts his pseudo-adventure thrice and each time says that he is Cretan. Let us consider the episodes schematically:

---

<sup>1</sup> Tsanava R., Three Interpretations of One Episode in the *Odyssey* (the Story of the Wooden Horse), *Semiotics*, Tbilisi 2007, 122-132.

<sup>2</sup> This device is also applied in *The Knight in the Tiger Skin*, where the stories of Tariel and Nestan are recounted several times.

### Story 1

The Phaeacians took Odysseus from the island of Scheria with their fastest vessel to the coast of his native island. Goddess Athena appears in the form of a herdsman before the newly awakened Laertides (XIII, 222). Athena the herdsman is the first person whom the returned hero tells about his adventures: XIII, 256-286 (line 30). Odysseus' 'story' can be schematically presented as follows:

The name of Ithaca has reached my Crete as well – the large island across the sea, and now I have come to Ithaca myself (256-257).

I have brought a lot of treasure and have left even more at home, with my children (258).

I fled from there (Crete); I have slain a man – fleet-footed Orsilochus, the son of Idomeneus<sup>3</sup> (259-261).

(Orsilochus) wanted to rob me of the booty (262), for which I had encountered a lot of perils in fights and on the sea (263-264).

I did not want to serve under his father's (Idomeneus') command in the Trojan War, and so gathered a new army (265-266).

Together with my faithful friends I ambushed Orsilochus and killed him with a spear (262-263).

The night was dark, and no one could see us. I killed him furtively, but nonetheless, to cover up the track, I went to the Phoenician ship after the murder, even offered them a gift and besought them to take us to Pylos or Elis, the renowned divine land of the Epeans (269-275).

They (the Phoenician sailors) did not mean to deceive us. Eventually, the waves cast us ashore here, to this place. We were too tired to have supper (276-280). Exhausted, I fell asleep. The Phoenicians took my goods out of the ship, put it on the sand beside me and headed for Sidon. So, I was left alone, broken-hearted (282-286).

### Story 2

On the second occasion Odysseus tells his story to the swineherd Eumaeus, when visiting him in his hut: XIV, 199-359. 160 lines are devoted to the story:

He (the narrator)<sup>4</sup> is Cretan. His father was rich, while his mother was a concubine and so he was regarded as an illegitimate child. After his father died, his brothers allotted him a small heritage.

---

<sup>3</sup> According to W. W. Merry, the name Orsilochus is fictitious, while 'fleet-footed' is Achilles' regular epithet. See Homer, *Odyssey*, with Introduction, notes, etc. by W. W. Merry, Oxford, the Clarendon Press 1961, comment on XIII, 259. Here and henceforth the text is quoted from this edition.

However, he married profitably and became a well-to-do man (199-215).

He gained more and more wealth from pirating (215-234). Not being wont to work, he and his men would plunder other countries – raided foreign lands nine times (230). He was highly reputed among the Cretans (234).

He fought together with Idomeneus in the Trojan War: people insisted that I and Idomeneus lead the ships (237-239), and I agreed. I fought nine years. In the tenth year, when the war was over, the warriors sailed home and god dispersed them in the sea. He (the narrator) returned home and spent a month with his family (244-245).

He (the narrator) started pirating again and headed for Egypt with nine ships (246-286). Arriving in Egypt, his companions started plundering the city. However, the locals beat them – many were killed, and some were enslaved. He appealed to the King of Egypt – clasped his knees and begged pardon. The king had mercy on him and took him to his palace, where the narrator spent 7 years.

In the eighth year one insidious Phoenician, who had ruined many, talked him over into accompanying him to Phoenicia. The narrator stayed there a year (287-294).

Afterwards, the Phoenician took him to Lybia, where he intended to sell him (the narrator) (295-299). They were caught in a gale and Zeus destroyed the ship (300-310). The narrator survived at Zeus' will – he gripped the mast (311-312).

After nine days of sail, he fetched the land of the Thesprotians (315-320), where King Pheidon received him as a guest.

It was Pheidon who told him about Odysseus: the latter was his guest on his way home. In evidence to this, the king showed the narrator Odysseus' plentiful riches that, according to him, would be enough for ten generations (322-326). The hero himself had gone to Dodona to learn about Zeus' will from the Holy Oak – how to return to Ithaca, openly or secretly (328-330). He had his ships and his men ready to return home. King Pheidon sent the narrator off before Odysseus' departure (334).

The ship that the narrator embarked headed for Dulichion (335). Pheidon asked the sailors to take his guest to King Acastus. However, the sailors enslaved him (the narrator) (340), divested him of his clothes, put on him rags, tied him up and left him on the deck.

---

<sup>4</sup> In this episode Odysseus does not take an invented name, and neither does Eumaeus ask his name; therefore, I found it more accurate to call Odysseus in Story 2 the Narrator.

Last night their ship arrived at the coasts of Ithaca (344), the sailors went on shore to get supper. Gods freed the narrator from chains (348), he swam to the coast (351) and hid in the bushes. The sailors searched for him to no avail and eventually left the place (352-356). Gods rescued him from the peril (357).

The narrator ends his story saying: Now I am here with you, perhaps I was not doomed to die (359).

### Story 3

On the third occasion Odysseus tells his story to Penelope XIX, 166-204, 38 lines.

'I see you want to know the story of my origin (166-167). I will tell you, but it will deepen my sorrow. This happens to everyone who goes away from his beloved family for a long time and like me, wanders destroyed amongst people, enters their families as a guest, being homeless himself' (168-170).

The island of Crete is in the wine-coloured sea – beautiful, rich, water-washed, abounding in people (172-173). There are 90 cities (174); different languages intermingle – those of the Achaeans (175), Eteocretans, Cidonians, Pelasgi, who belong to the Dorians of three-fold race (176-177). The capital is Cnossos, where reigned Minos, my grandfather.

Minos was the parent of great Deucalion (180), who fathered Idomeneus and me (181).

Idomeneus, my renowned brother, sailed in a round-bowed ship to distant Troy together with the Atrides (181-183).

My name is Aethon (183) and I was born after Idomeneus; he is older and superior in power (184).

I saw Odysseus on Crete and gave him a gift (185). The storm had cast him to Crete (186); on his way to Troy he had been caught in a tempest (187), which had carried him out of his course from cape Malea and he had had to harbour in Amnisus, near the cave of Ilithuia (188-189).

Odysseus visited Idomeneus in the town, saying that he was his guest (190); he had a great respect for Idomeneus, but the latter had gone to Troy 10-11 days earlier (192-193).

I hosted Odysseus in the palace instead of the King; the reception was generous (193-195). We treated Odysseus and his men with bread, fire-coloured wine and meat from the abundant stock gathered from our people. The Achaeans stayed here 12 days (199); Boreas, maddened by the Daemon, would not let them go into the sea (200-203). The tempest calmed down on the thirteenth day and the Ithacans went into the sea (203).

In this way 'Aethon' presented many lies as the truth (203-204). Ἴσχε ψείδα πολλὰ λέγων ἐτύμοισιν ὁμοῖα (203).

When Odysseus-Aethon told the story of Odysseus' visit to Crete, the woman wept bitterly (204-209). When she had relieved herself by weeping, she asked the teller: If my husband was really with you, tell me what clothes he wore (218). Aethon answered: Although a lot of time elapsed, 20 years (222), I remember his purple mantle fastened by a gold brooch with two catches featuring a dog holding a fawn between his fore paws (226-228); he wore a very fine and glistening shirt (232-234). At hearing this Penelope wept even more bitterly (249); she believed the 'stranger's words (250) and said: So far I only pitied you, but now you are a friend in my house (254-255).

Odysseus-Aethon proceeded with the story: I was told that Odysseus went to the rich land of the Thesprotians (170-171); he is bringing countless riches, gathered from different peoples (272-273).

His ship and friends were lost in the sea (274)<sup>5</sup>. When they reached the island of Thrinacia, they incurred the wrath of Zeus and Helios (275-276), as despite the warning, the sailors slaughtered Helios' bulls (276-277).

Odysseus reached the land of the Phaeacians (178-179).<sup>6</sup> The Phaeacians gave him gifts but Odysseus decided to travel to more lands and gather more wealth, as no one can compare with him in obtaining riches (283-284).

I was told this story (i. e. Odysseus' adventure on Crete) by King Pheidon of the Thesprotians (287); he also swore that Odysseus had his ships and his men ready to return home (288-290).

Pheidon let me leave earlier, by the very first ship that headed for Dulichion<sup>7</sup> (291-292). He even showed me Odysseus' treasure, which would be enough for ten generations (293-295). The king said that Odysseus was gone to Dodona to learn about Zeus' will – how to return to Ithaca, openly or secretly (296-299).

Odysseus is alive and will come soon – when the old moon goes down and the new moon appears (307).<sup>8</sup>

<sup>5</sup> Here Odysseus the no-man speaks of his companions' death for the first time.

<sup>6</sup> Odysseus omitted his stay with Calypso – the episode with the longest story time spanning 7 years.

<sup>7</sup> The location of Dulichion is not known. According to Odysseus, the island is near Ithaca.

<sup>8</sup> In this case the rise of the new moon means that Odysseus will return tomorrow. According to *Odyssey*, XXI, 258; XX, 276-278, that day (i. e. 'tomorrow') was the celebration in honour of Apollo, normally held on the first day of month. See Homer,

Eumaeus too tells the story of the 'Cretan' visitor first to Telemachus (XVI, 62-67)<sup>9</sup> and then to Penelope (XVII, 523-547).<sup>10</sup>

In the *Odyssey*, Over 270 lines are devoted to Odysseus' Cretan origin and Crete-related stories, which is not a small number. The lines together make up almost half of one book.

First of all, let us single out the most essential details that are under a special emphasis in all the stories – Odysseus is Cretan and is very close to Idomeneus (is either his brother or his closest fellow fighter).

Scholars mostly attribute Odysseus' persistent reference to his pseudo-Cretan origin to Crete's reputation. Owing to its location, wealth and importance the island was popular not only among the Greeks, but in the whole Mediterranean. Hence, scholars believe that Odysseus' pseudo-adventure reveals the desire of the king of small Ithaca to have his name associated with the large and renowned island. It is also known that the Cretans were downright liars.<sup>11</sup> However, with regard to the Homeric principles of text structuring, it is hard to believe that Homer could have devoted so many lines to Odysseus' yet another, the least harmless, lie.

In my opinion, this story is fiction associated with Odysseus' unconscious and innermost dream. In fact, twenty years ago Odysseus sailed to the Trojan War with selected heroes. He returned alone from Troy after 10 years of roaming. This was among his greatest concerns (the point is clearly illustrated in the text and therefore I will not dwell on it). And truly, hundreds of Achaean warriors, including renowned heroes, fell in Troy. Eventually part of them, with their commanders or without them, re-

*Odyssey*, op. cit., comment on XIX, 198. A well-known device applied in ancient writings is revenge on a holiday dedicated to a deity. For example, Orestes kills Agamemnon at the festival of Hera (see Euripides' Trojan cycle). Such revenge acquires the function of offering a sacrifice (see Tsanova R., *Mythoritual Models and Symbols in Ancient Greek Writing and Georgian Literary and Ethnological Parallels*, Tbilisi 2005, 175).

<sup>9</sup> Eumaeus' story: he (the no-man) comes from Crete. He says he has seen many peoples and lands – such is his lot. This time he escaped from the Thesprotians' ship and came to my hut (XVI, 62-67).

<sup>10</sup> Eumaeus gives praise to the guest when talking to Penelope – he is a good teller, comes from Crete and is of Minos' descent (523-524). He has endured a lot of suffering. He said Odysseus is very close at hand, in the land of Thesprotians, and is going to return home with a lot of riches (525-527).

<sup>11</sup> It is not indicated in the text whether Odysseus is well aware of this quality of the Cretans or not, but his 'stories' reveal his desire to assert the opposite. Anyway, logically, the Cretans' reputation of liars could not have been the motivation for Odysseus' calling himself Cretan; on the contrary, he wants others to believe him.

turned home: the Myrmidons without Achilles but with Neoptolemus, son of Achilles; the Argoans with Agamemnon (who was violently murdered at home); the Lacedaemonians returned after 7 years of roaming and suffering together with Menelaus and Helen. Nestor of Pylos lost his beloved son in the war. Great Ajaxes were also killed. The only commander who succeeded in bringing back his people with minimal losses was Idomeneus of Crete. That is why Odysseus' innermost dream is associated with Cretan Idomeneus. Odysseus would have given up everything to return home together with his men; therefore, having stepped on the land of Ithaca, willingly or unconsciously, he was obsessed by an allusion between himself and the successful commander. In my opinion, this fiction differs from Odysseus' other lies; calling himself Cretan is his special guise presenting the Homeric hero anew. It can be argued that this trait of Odysseus, the guise, became an interesting model for the writers of the following generations.<sup>12</sup> The immediate goal of the paper is not to reason over the terms 'fiction', 'truth', 'falsehood'. A lot has been written on these questions from Aristotle's times to the present.<sup>13</sup>

Now I will dwell on the term ψεύδος. U. Hölscher refers to Plotinus' words that ψεύδος, ψευδές means 'objectively deceived', 'unreal'. The verbal form of the word means to deceive someone, or to be deceived. Hölscher observed that in old German and its dialects the forms corresponding to ψεύδομαι do not have a negative implication, like the phrase: λέει ψέμματα, which means: λέει ιστορίες φαντασιώνεται.<sup>14</sup> D. N. Maronites detected a chain of lies with sixteen links.<sup>15</sup>

Now let us give a closer consideration to the details of the suggested viewpoint:

In mythos Idomeneus was the grandson of Minos. He was the commander of 80 ships, where had gathered the warriors from six cities of Crete (*Il.*, II, 645-652; *Apollod.*, *Epit.*, III, 13. This text mentions a smaller number). In the *Iliad*, Idomeneus especially distinguished himself during the fight with the enemy's navy (*Il.*, XIII, 210-539). He took part in the games held at Patroclus' burial ceremony. Idomeneus sat together with

<sup>12</sup> It suffices to recall James Joyce's *Ulysses*, to say nothing about other literary works. All in this novel is based on the interplay of imaginations, allusions and masks. None of the characters is, or must not be who they are, or at times join in the 'play' and perform the role that they want, or do not want to perform.

<sup>13</sup> Шталь И. В., Гомеровский Эпос, Москва 1975, 37-68.

<sup>14</sup> Hölscher U., *Οδύσσεια*, ένα έπος ανάμεσα στο παραμύθι και στο μυθιστόρημα, Αθήνα 2007, 294.

<sup>15</sup> Μαρωνίτης Δ. Ν., Επιλεγόμενα στην Ομηρική *Οδύσσεια*, Αθήνα 2005, 67.

other Greek heroes in the wooden horse that destroyed Troy. There are different versions concerning his further fate: according to one of them, Idomeneus returned home safe together with his men and had a happy reign, while the other version says that he returned home, but encountered a tense situation and was eventually ousted from the island.<sup>16</sup>

Homeric *Odyssey* is the only source that tells of Idomeneus' return to Crete together with his men and of his happy reign afterwards. Scholarly literature has nothing about the pre-Homeric roots of the version. Post-Homeric versions also feature Idomeneus' lot differently. Now let us return to the central point – when structuring an epic, a writer cannot follow mutually controversial versions of the myth. The author chooses the one that best fits his central conceptual line. The study of common structural principles of epics clearly revealed that out of available mythic versions a writer chooses the one that he finds acceptable for his conception and aesthetics. If such a version does not exist, the poet invents it. In the case of Idomeneus, Homer himself provides an explanation, and in my opinion,

---

<sup>16</sup> In my opinion, the version of ousting Idomeneus is also quite noteworthy: it parallels with Agamemnon's adventure on the one hand and with Odysseus' story on the other. Therefore, I will briefly present the versions associated with this character: Idomeneus was one of Helen's suitors and was distinguished by his good looks. When the united Greek army gathered on the island of Aulis, envoys came from Crete saying: Idomeneus would lead 10 ships to assault Troy provided Agamemnon shared his power with him (some versions say that this condition was accepted, while others have the opposite. However, the *Iliad* makes no allusions in this regard. Here Idomeneus is only the commander of his army and obeys Agamemnon like others). Idomeneus chose Merion, the son of Molos as his assistant, who was rumoured to be one of Idomeneus' illegal children. It is also known that Idomeneus' shield featured a shepherd, which pointed to that his progenitor was Helios, and his helmet was decorated with boar tusks.

According to Apollodorus, Leucus, brought up in Idomeneus' household, seduced and became the lover of Meda, Idomeneus' wife (compare: the story of Agamemnon – Clytemnestra – Aegisthus). Later Leucus ousted Meda and Idomeneus' daughter from the palace and killed them in a temple. Afterwards Leucus made himself king over 10 cities. Meanwhile, Idomeneus was caught in a storm on his way from Troy to Crete. He promised Poseidon to sacrifice the first man who he would encounter. The latter appeared to be his son or daughter. When Idomeneus was preparing for the sacrifice, the country was gripped by the epidemic and the offering ritual was put off (in other versions, gods did not accept his offering or Idomeneus did not make the offering). Leucus took the opportunity and ousted him. Idomeneus went to Calambria and settled there (Apollod., *Epit.*, III, 3, 1; VI, 9-10; Цец., *Схолии к Ликофрону*, 384-386; Serv. *Coment. ad Aen.*, III, 121. XI, 264; Verg.; *Aen.*; III, 121-400; Myth. Vat., I, 195; Diod., V, 79; Нуг., *Fab.*, 81; Paus., V, 25, 5; Филострат. *Героические деяния*, 7; Zimmerman J. E., *Dictionary of Classical Mythology*, New York: Bantam Books 1980.



even a hint: Greek Nestor tells Telemachus what he knows – who returned home and how. He says: πάντας δ' Ἰδομενεὺς Κρήτην εἰσήγαγ' ἑταίρους, οἳ φύγον ἐκ πολέμου, πόντος δέ οἱ οὐ τιν' ἀπηύρα (All his company, too, did Idomeneus bring to C r e t e, all who escaped the war, and the sea robbed him of none) (*Od.*, III, 191-192).<sup>17</sup>

I believe that the key to Odysseus' allusion (Books XIII, XIV, XIX) lies exactly in Nestor's story (Book III). Nestor tells Telemachus first what he has seen with his own eyes and afterwards what he has heard about other Greek heroes' return. It is also noteworthy that the story is told by Nestor, who is the most reliable source of information and whose words had special power and significance (let us recall Nestor's role in the *Iliad*). Nestor mentions Odysseus' successful return together with his men along with the 'homecoming' stories of other heroes of the Trojan War: the Myrmidons came back together with Achilles' son, Philoctetes is alive (his companions do not feature), and Agamemnon's fearful story must have reached you too (*Od.*, III, 185-200).

Now let us consider all the three stories by Odysseus and their interrelationships:

Story 1: Odysseus wakes up and cannot recognize his native island. Athena has veiled Ithaca in fog so that no one can see the returned hero earlier than needed (XIII, 190-196). The Laertides is taking care of the treasure presented by the Phaeacians; he counts each and every tripod and cauldron (XIII, 215-219). Athena appears before him as a herdsman of sheep/goats (ἐπιβώτορι μῆλων, 222) and describes the island in detail (XIII, 237-249). This is truly Ithaca! However, Odysseus starts fabricating a lie: οὐδ' ὄγ' ἀληθέα εἶπε, πάλιν δ' ὄγε λάξετο μῦθον (XIII, 254). This passage translates word for word as: (he) did not tell the truth, gave the story a different direction. W. W. Merry comments that (Odysseus) gave his story a different turn, opposite of ἀληθέα.<sup>18</sup> The next line reads as: αἰεὶ ἐνὶ στήθεσσι νόον πολυκερδέα νομῶν (XIII, 255) - 'ever revolving in his breast thoughts of great cunning'.<sup>19</sup>

When Athena the herdsman heard Odysseus' concoction (i. e. Story 1), caressed him on his cheek, transformed into a beautiful woman and said:

<sup>17</sup> Homer, *Odyssey* with an English Translation by A. T. Murray, Cambridge, MA., Harvard University Press; London, William Heinemann, Ltd. 1919 (<http://www.perseus.tufts.edu>).

<sup>18</sup> Homer, *Odyssey*, op. cit., XIII, comment on 254.

<sup>19</sup> English translation by A. T. Murray.

He must be insidious and cunning who wishes to overcome you in guile, even god will find this difficult (καὶ εἰ θεὸς ἀντιάσειε XIII, 292). Afterwards Athena goes on with a tint of humor in her voice: (σχέπλιε, ποιηλομήτα, δόλων ἄτ' XIII, 293) - Bold man, crafty in counsel, insatiate in deceit, not even in thine own land (XIII, 293-294). However, Athena says: You used to love lying already as a child: λήξειν ἀπατάων μύθων τε κλοπιῶν οἳ τοι πεδόθεν φίλοι εἰσὶν (XIII, 294-295). ἀπατάω means 'deceive', 'cheat'. i. e. Athena analyzes and defines precisely one of Odysseus' intrinsic properties - trickery. She also adds that this quality of Odysseus does not at all irritate her; on the contrary, she observes that Odysseus and she are alike in scheming. Odysseus is the best among the mortals owing to his advice and contrivance, while Athena is the best among the deities (εἰδότες ἄμφω κέρδε' 296-297).

ἐπεὶ σὺ μὲν ἐσσι βροτῶν ὄχ' ἄριστος ἀπάντων βουλή καὶ μύθοισιν, ἐγὼ δ' ἐν πᾶσι θεοῖσι μή τι τε κλέομαι καὶ κέρδεσιν' (XIII, 297-299). This means that Athena's appreciation of Odysseus' trickery, which he has had from childhood, is not negative (she regards it as prank); moreover, this ἀπατάω acquires the sense of 'resourcefulness' and 'giving various excellent pieces of advice'. In fact, the dialogue reveals Athena's special fondness for Odysseus, which exceeds her appreciation of other heroes - they are alike. At the same time, Athena is scolding Odysseus - how could you not recognize me, your helper and benefactor. Was it not I who gave you the favour of the Phaeacians? (XIII, 300-303). After this 'lyrical' digression, the goddess passes to the point and explains to Odysseus how to behave afterwards: I came to think all it out properly together with you: where to hide away the Phaeacian treasure; also to tell you how I have destined your fate in your kingdom (XIII, 304-307). Athena in fact approves of Odysseus' decision to return to his native island as a stranger - not to reveal his true identity. This had two purposes: to find out who is faithful and who is treacherous and to endure humiliation to the maximum (ἀλλὰ σιωπῇ πάσχειν ἄλγεα πολλὰ XIII, 309-310) to justify his pending revenge.

As concerns the fiction fabricated by Odysseus on his being Cretan, Athena says nothing about it. Inventing a story (μῦθος) and charging it with implications is Odysseus' prerogative, where the goddess does not interfere.

The aim of Story 1 is to explain to an unknown herdsman how and why he came to Ithaca, that the riches belong to him (he earned them with his blood and sweat). He will not give them up to anyone although he is alone. He did not yield even to the fleet-footed son of Idomeneus and did not allow him to take over. Even the Phoenicians did not touch his wealth. As we see, the cen-

tral motif of the episode is the treasure. A small-livestock herdsman must have been deeply impressed that a noble of the renowned island, the hero of the Trojan War visited their small island. However, Odysseus wasted his efforts in vain. The herd appeared to be Athena herself. So, Odysseus' labour of telling Story 1 was rendered purposeless.

When telling Story 2, Odysseus changed the leitmotif (the treasure is in a safe place; he does not face any threat). What Stories 1 and 2 have in common is that the narrator is Cretan and is close to Idomeneus. It is also noteworthy that he tells Story 2 in Eumaeus' hut, by the fire; Odysseus already knows for certain that he is in his homeland and knows how to behave (Athena has given him advice). So, Story 2 somewhat resembles fireside story weaving on the one hand and the character's inner meditation and splitting on the other.

Now let us compare Odysseus of Ithaca and the Cretan 'visitor':

<i>The Ithacan</i>	<i>The Cretan</i>
1. Is a legal child	1. Is an illegal child
2. Is the only child <sup>20</sup>	2. Has brothers
3. Is married to the lady of his rank	3. His wife is superior to him in terms of origin and wealth
4. Loves his homeland and family; does not like war.	4. Is a keen warrior
5. Is the King, 'shepherd of people'	5. Is a pirate (raided different countries 9 times). Earned fame on Crete owing to his riches
6. Is the only commander of the Ithacan navy	6. Shares power with Idomeneus <sup>21</sup>
7. Has not yet returned from Troy	7. Returned from Troy; spent 1 month at home and went on pirating.
8. Has not been to Egypt	8. Was arrested in Egypt when pirating, where he spent 7 years
9. Has not been to Phoenicia	9. Was nearly sold in Phoenicia. There he spent 1 year.
10. When visiting the Phaeacians, hears from Demodocus the story of Troy and Odysseus	10. Hears the story of Odysseus from the Thesprotians

<sup>20</sup> The typical feature of Odysseus' family is fathering one son: Laertes was the only son Arcesilaus, Odysseus was the only Laertides, and Telemachus was Odysseus' only child: ὄδε γὰρ ἡμετέρην γενεὴν μούνωσε Κρονίων (XVI, 117 ff.). This is the epic version of the myth. According to another version, Odysseus fathered a son with Circe, but Homer does not mention this.

<sup>21</sup> 'Cretan' Odysseus was not entitled to full rights as an illegal child. He leads only two ships to Ilium; i. e. he is the second.

The Cretan guest does not mention his name and neither is he asked. He is referred to as ξενός (stranger, alien, without kith or kin). The characters like Cretan Odysseus are called 'no-men'.<sup>22</sup>

There are many noteworthy points in this story: it is highlighted that the Cretan no-man was in high esteem owing to his wealth. His father was revered among the Cretans for his wealth, prosperity, and the valour of his sons:

ὅς τότ' ἐνὶ Κρήτεσσι θεὸς ὡς πίετο δῆμῳ  
 ὄλβῳ τε πλούτῳ τε καὶ υἰάσι κυδαλίμοισιν.  
 (XIV, 205-206)

In the same episode it is remarkable that the no-man (the Cretan guest, i. e. Odysseus) did not wish to go to the Trojan War, but could not do otherwise: οὐδέ τι μῆχος ἦεν ἀνήνασθαι, χαλεπή δ' ἔχε δῆμου φῆμις (XIV, 238-239).<sup>23</sup> It is also known that neither did Ithacan Odysseus want to go to the war. Their wishes are the same but the motivation is different.

The no-man's brothers allotted him a small portion of the inherited wealth as to an illegal child (XIV, 210). According to the laws of those times, he did not even have the right to claim the property. All he succeeded to was regarded as his brothers' gift.

The no-man did better than other fortune-hunters. He 'secured' a well-to-do spouse owing to his good name and ingenuity:

ἡγαγόμεν δὲ γυναιῖκα πολυκλήρων ἀνδρώπων  
 εἴνεκ' ἐμῆς ἀρετῆς, ἐπεὶ οὐκ ἀποφώλιος ἦα  
 (XIV, 211-212)

The no-man's self-appreciation is very interesting:

ἀλλ' ἔμπης καλάμην γέ σ' ὀίομαι εἰσορόωντα  
 γιγνώσκειν· ἦ γάρ με δύη ἔχει ἥλιθα πολλή  
 (XIV, 214-215)

<sup>22</sup> When Odysseus and his companions came to Polyphemus' cave, the Cyclops asked his name. Odysseus said he was called Οὔτις (Οὔτις ἐμοὶ γ' ὄνομα IX, 366), which was translated into English as 'no-man'. Later the word was established as a term designating a particular type of a literary character.

<sup>23</sup> When analyzing this and the following lines, W. W. Merry comments that there was no way he (the no-man) could go against the Cretans' appeal, against people's insisting call, which ran counter to his will. The Cretans wanted him, the illegal child, to share leadership with Idomeneus, the legal ruler. The text does not provide a clear motivation for the no-man's reluctance: whether he disliked war in general, or whether he did not wish to be subordinated to Idomeneus.

(Now all that strength is gone; yet even so, in seeing the stubble, methinks thou mayest judge what the grain was).<sup>24</sup>

Along with bravery, Ares and Athena endowed the no-man with love for wars and the fighting spirit (ἀρηξήνορτον) (XIV, 216-217). Valiant at war, he is not keen on working in a field and leading a peaceful life (XIV, 222-223).

Ithacan Odysseus is an excellent warrior and hunter (let us recall the boar hunt, after which he became the so-called 'marked' hero; likewise the deer hunt on the island of Aea. Combats are much more frequent). However, the idea that Odysseus does not like war, wishes that it end soon, wants to return home and does everything for this is threaded throughout both the *Iliad* and *Odyssey*.

The no-man used to be a pirate before going to Troy. He raided foreign countries nine times; very soon he accumulated wealth and became powerful, earning respect among the Cretans (XIV, 233-234). Wealth is under a focus in this story as well. In general, the theme of wealth appears important in the *Odyssey*.

The no-man says: when the Trojan War started, the Cretans chose me and renowned Idomeneus to go to Ilion (XIV, 237-238).

To make his story sound real, Odysseus combines the real with the invented. For example, the no-man's 7-year stay in Egypt parallels Odysseus' stay on the island of Ogygia with Goddess Calypso, while the 1 year spent with the Phoenicians is analogous to Odysseus' visit to Circe's island of Aea. This literary device can be called the fiction of fiction. Naturally, the basic fiction (i. e. Odysseus' 'real' story<sup>25</sup>) is taken as a true fact.

<sup>24</sup> English translation by A. T. Murray. According to the text commentator, this Greek phrase gave birth to the Latin popular quotation *ex stipula cognoscere* (to know by the straw). See Homer, *Odyssey*, op. cit. (XIV, Comment on 214). We can draw parallels with the words of Tarel, gone wild, as he says to Avtandil: 'აწ მამბნდლობა ჩემობსა სახე ვარ ოღენ ჩრდობსა' (333) - My person now is but a shadow of what it was then (translated by M. S. Wardrop, 1912).

<sup>25</sup> There is a scholarly opinion that from the land of the Cicones Odysseus transcends into an irreal world, a different world. See Segal Ch. P., *The Phaeacians and the Symbolism of Odysseus' Return*, Arion 1962, 17-36; Видаль-Наке П., Чёрный охотник. Формы мышления и формы общества в греческом мире, перевод с французского, Москва 2001; Edwards A. T., *Homer's Ethical Geography: Country and City in the Odyssey*. In: *American Philological Journal* 123, 1993, 27-77.

There is a three-fold fiction in the *Odyssey*: Myth 1. The story of Odysseus' return from Troy; 2. Odysseus in an irreal world; 3. Odysseus-the-no-man allusion - his presumable adventure, where the desirable and the real intermingle. Such a phantasmagoria can become an inexhaustible source for stories for anyone, especially for a writer.

With reference to it, Fiction II acquires the function of invention, but the hero tries to veil this falsehood and makes it appear as real. As I have already mentioned, in several points Ithacan Odysseus is drastically different from the no-man: by origin, family, occupation and function in the Trojan War. Invention of such a different biography can be explained in many ways. Among the possible versions is that the given image could have been one of Odysseus' self-projections, one of his masks, the driving force behind it being the desire to 'be Idomeneus', 'the successful Cretan', who, according to Homer, returned himself and brought back his men. These allusions make up a different text structure, which on its part knits an invisible but dense network, creating a different level of the traditional text intended only for imaginative readers. These very allusions, hints and imaginations point to the complexity and versatility of human nature. All great writers try to lead the reader into the labyrinth of his characters' thoughts and dreams. The more multifaceted the characters are, the more interesting they appear. The reader, enriched with compassion and a new experience, comes out of the labyrinth together with the characters. If this is the outcome, the author has achieved the goal (This was the principle of ancient aesthetics).

The no-man's story did not arise any doubts in the swineherd Eumaeus; moreover, the stranger's mishaps touched him, but he did not believe that Odysseus was alive and would soon return. Eumaeus addresses the 'wretched stranger' *δελὲ ξείνων* 361): your mention of Odysseus was not discreet; I do not believe, why did you deceive me? (XIV, 363-365). Unlike Story 1, told to Athena - in vein, as it later appeared, Story 2 is divided into two: Eumaeus believes the no-man's adventure but does not believe the story about Odysseus'. The swineherd has his own arguments (XIV, 366-385). He says that he does not go any more to Penelope, who would always call him when a stranger happened to come to their island. The Queen and the inhabitants of the palace would surround the guest and ask him a lot of questions (XIV, 373-377). Eumaeus took a strong dislike to idle questioning especially after the visit of one Etolian who was wanted in his homeland for murder. The Etolian told Eumaeus that he had seen Odysseus on Crete in Idomeneus' palace. Odysseus was busy repairing his ships and told him that he would come back to Ithaca in summer or in autumn together with his friends and would bring the treasure that no tongue could describe (*καὶ φάτ' ἐλεύσεσθαι ἢ ἐς Θέρος ἢ ἐς ὀπώραν, πολλὰ χρήματ' ἄγοντα, σὺν ἀντιθέοις ἐτάροισι* XIV, 384-385). Now that Eumaeus had abandoned even this last hope, he asked the visitor not to lie to him (*μήτε τί μοι ψεύδεσσι* 387), not to expect warmer welcome in return

for the lie. He revered Zeus, the patron of strangers (XIV, 386-389). Eumaeus believed that so many false stories were spun about Odysseus because no one had seen his body; so, it would be nice if even one witness appeared who would claim to have seen the dead Laertides; all would be clear then.<sup>26</sup>

I believe it is very interesting to trace what Odysseus himself thinks of lying. Odysseus the no-man says to hopeless Eumaeus: I swear that Odysseus shall return soon (ἀλλ' ἐγὼ οὐκ αὐτῶς μυθήσομαι, ἀλλὰ σὺν ὄρκῳ, ὡς νεῖται Ὀδυσσεύς XIV, 151-152). Afterwards Odysseus the no-man adds: I hate all who tell deceitful stories because lies because of poverty (ἐχθρὸς γάρ μοι κεῖνος ὁμῶς Ἄϊδαο πύλῃσι γίγνεται, ὅς πενίη εἴκων ἀπατήλια βάζει XIV, 156-157), which means that Odysseus finds unacceptable lying for profiting. Apparently, he has his own idea of lying. Moreover, giving a false oath is totally unacceptable for him. Odysseus tries to assure the swineherd in his truth and bets (XIV, 391-400).

Story 3 is intended for Penelope. Therefore, Odysseus resorts to another fiction (he does not pay attention to the possibility that the swineherd Eumaeus may tell the Queen the stranger's story in detail and he can be caught out<sup>27</sup>). In this story Odysseus particularly highlights the grandeur and riches of Crete. The divine king of this great island, Minos<sup>28</sup>, is his

<sup>26</sup> Although Eumaeus does not count Odysseus among the living, during the offering ritual before the supper in the guest's honour he threw a piece of offering meat into the fire and asked gods to return Odysseus home (XIV, 422-424).

<sup>27</sup> When Penelope asked Eumaeus about the visitor, the swineherd answered: he is a good teller, comes from Crete and is of Minos' descent. He has endured a lot of suffering. He says Odysseus is close at hand, in the land of Thesprotians, and is going to return home with a lot of riches (523-527). These words show that Eumaeus tells the queen the most relevant information from the visitor's story. The swineherd also briefly describes the guest to Telemachus: he is from Crete; they say he has seen a lot of people and lands - this has been his lot. He has recently escaped from the Thesprotians' ship and has come to our hut. Now you are to take care of him (XVI, 62-67).

<sup>28</sup> There is one noteworthy detail: in the *Iliad*, the epithet of Crete is 'of a hundred cities' (ἐκατόμηποις II, 649); the same epithet is used in Virgil's *Aeneid* (Centum urbes habitant magnas III, 106), while according to the no-man, Crete has 90 cities (ἐννῆκοντα). This may indicate that the no-man does not know this fact although he describes in detail the Cretan population (XIX, 174-176). Here the commentator also mentions the difficulty of translating the term related to Minos: ἐννεώροος may mean (like in *Od.*, X, 19) 'full maturity', 'adulthood'; however, if translated word for word, it means 'nine years'. By connecting the word with βασιλευε and ὀαριστής the commentator reads the passage as 'for nine years he was associated with Zeus'. With regard to Plato's *Minos*, the passage can be understood in the following way: Minos took advice

grandfather, and Idomeneus is his brother. His name is Aethon. One of the meanings of Αἴθων (XIX, 183) is 'the fiery red-haired'<sup>29</sup>. According to various sources, Odysseus was red-haired.<sup>30</sup> So, the name Odysseus calls himself refers to a physical property. The name Aethon is one of his masks. The goal of the Story-Fiction 3 is: a. to win Penelope's liking by his noble pedigree; b. to convince her that Odysseus is alive and will come soon. Unlike the previous story, Aethon appears as Odysseus' host in Crete. He describes to Penelope the details of Odysseus' clothes and in this way fully wins her trust. The only person who believed most of the story by Odysseus the no-man is Penelope (Athena responds with a banter, Eumaeus did not believe him, while Penelope's heart started beating intensely, although neither did she believe the second part of the story - that Odysseus would soon return).

Odysseus the no-man 'reveals' his identity to Penelope's suitors as well, but says nothing about his origin. Once a well-to-do man, he got in touch with pirates and went to Egypt with their help, where he was arrested and sold as a slave to a Cyprian; now he has come from Cyprus (XVII, 415-444).

Odysseus could not convince anyone but kindle hope in their hearts - a very fragile one but still a hope. It can be said that to a certain extent the no-man achieved his goal.

Theorists of ancient literature set criteria - what kind of a text can be called a work of art. To formulate this conception, especially noteworthy are Aristotle's *Poetics* and *Rhetoric*, Plato's *The State*, Book 3 and several

from Zeus in every 9 years in a secret cave. See Homer, *Odyssey*, op. cit., comment on XIX, 178.

<sup>29</sup> Дворецкий И. X., Древнегреческо-русский словарь, Москва 1958; Liddel H. G., Scott R., Greek-English Lexicon, Oxford 1968.

<sup>30</sup> One text passage is noteworthy in connection with Odysseus' hair colour: having killed the suitors, Odysseus washed and put on his clothes; Athena brightened him up with good looks, added to him height XXIII, 153-158) and κόμας, ὑακινθίνῳ ἄνθει ὁμοίαις (XXIII, 158). This last phrase is translated in two ways: his hair became curly like a Hyacinth petal or his hair became hyacinth-coloured. See Homer, *Odyssey*, op. cit., comment on XXIII, 158. The second version is more widespread and is associated with Theocritus' phrase: μέλαν ἔντι καὶ ἄγραπτὰ ὑάκινθος - of the colour of black hyacinth (10. 28) - i. e. Odysseus' hair was of hyacinth colour. Hyacinth is a many-coloured flower growing in the Mediterranean (it can be ink-coloured, red, black, etc.) The mineral hyacinth can be transparent red or pinkish manganeseous (see Советский энциклопедический словарь, Москва 1981). The commentator of the *Odyssey* is inclined to think that the phrase refers to a black colour; however, in my opinion, this is not suggested outright in the text.



chapters from *The Laws*, the first three books of Strabo's *Geography*, Lucian's *A True Story*, Quintilian's *Institution Oratoria*, etc. Works by these and other authors are summed up in the scholia of the works by Dionysus of Tracia, where we read: Four qualities embellish a poet: meter (τὸ μέτρον), fiction, myth (ὁ μῦθος), narration (ἡ ἱστορία) and verbal means (ἡ λέξις) a work that lacks any of these is not a poetic work, even if versified.<sup>31</sup>

Homer inserts in a myth (fiction) other fictions that converge with the central mythic narrative as independent stories. These fictions, on their part, have an important function in presenting the epic heroes' characters (χαρακτήρ), as they lead into their innermost (unexpressed) feelings and sensations.

The above-presented three fictions are discussed basically at the level of comparing textual information. The linguistic aspect is also interesting. The author offers a masterly succession of affirmative, subjunctive and optative moods, puts rhetorical questions and uses popular quotations. Likewise noteworthy are the literary devices of extension and reduction to narrate the same story. These devices enable the character to achieve his goals. So, the fictions, apart from conveying Odysseus' dreams, are brilliant examples of the author's mastery (skillfulness).

---

<sup>31</sup> Diels H. 25, A, A, 25. ACA (Ancient Commentators on Aristotle), Berlin: Reiner 1882-1909. (<http://www.kcl.ac.uk/kis/schools/hums/philosophy/aca/cag-guide.pdf>).