

Tamar Aptsiauri, Teona Gelashvili (Tbilisi)

**Lexicographical Studies Based on Euthymius the  
Athonite's Translations of Gregory of Nazianzus's 30<sup>th</sup> and  
31<sup>st</sup> *Orations* and Gregory of Nyssa's *The Life of Moses***

Examining original philosophical and theological works as well as their relevant early translations in the context of contemporary humanities is a subject of complex research. A comprehensive study of a particular translation involves an assessment of the original version in terms of the concepts and world-view it conveys, on the one hand, and a textual and philological analysis of the translated version, on the other, lexicological studies constituting one of the most important aspects of the latter. Development of a scientific terminology that can function as a special-purpose language is, in general, preconditioned by several factors and entails a rather long-term work. The history of the making of the Georgian theological terminology extends back over centuries. This process started in the oldest (5<sup>th</sup> c.) translated and original monuments of different genres and reached perfection in the translations of the Gelati Hellenophile theological school. Succeeding the old tradition, the translators from the Iviron Monastery at Mount Athos, including Euthymius the Athonite, a prominent 11<sup>th</sup> c. translator and founder of the Iviron school, had undoubtedly played a significant role in unfolding large scale translation activities. The present paper is an attempt to analyze the development of the Georgian theological terminology at its early-stage based on Euthymius the Athonite's translations of two works pertaining to two different genres. Notably, our research will focus on the analysis of the interrelation between Greek Gnoseological terms and Euthymius's corres-

ponding versions based on Gregory of Nazianzus's dogmatic writings – 30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> *Orations* – and Gregory of Nyssa's exegetical work entitled *The Life of Moses*.

Cognizing the infinite Divine essence and dogmatic handling of the theoretical knowledge gained through the contemplation of the Christian Logos in the course of spiritual perfection is a great achievement of the Cappadocian school of theology. Subsequently, the early-stage translation of the above works into Georgian provides interesting material for observing the formation of the Georgian theological terminology as well as understanding the polysemy of relevant Greek terms. The broad range of Greek gnoseological terminology incorporates lexical units that underwent substantive semasiological changes while being transformed from everyday language-level into a theological term. Georgian translators most probably faced the same problem. Their task was apparently to render the extremely diverse Greek epistemological terminology and simultaneously overcome the conventional understanding of their equivalent terms established in everyday Georgian reality.

The most general term describing the cognition of the *Ens Supremum* is the Greek ἡ θεωρία, the original meaning of which is *observing, seeing, gazing, viewing*. This meaning is further augmented by its philosophical denotation as a mental contemplation of the transcendental.<sup>1</sup> Gregory of Nyssa's *The Life of Moses*, representing an extremely significant mystical and exegetical work, provides interesting material for understanding this lexical unit that has become a gnoseological term. "Theoria", standing for science in Christian theology, is opposed to "action", a term denoting practical activity (Melikishvili D., 128). The basic Georgian equivalent of the Greek "theoria" is *seeing*. The 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> cc. Georgian translators (George the Hagiorite and Ephrem Mtsire) also attest the terms "visual" and "active" as antonyms (*ibid*). The Greek θεωρία in Euthymius's translation of *The Life of Moses* has three matches: looking, seeing, and perceiving (ხედვა<sup>2</sup>, ხილვა და გულისწმობა-ყოფა). Each of them reflects the

<sup>1</sup> Melikishvili D., *History of Old Georgian of Philosophical-Theological Terminology*, Tbilisi 1999, 128.

<sup>2</sup> τότε προσάγεται τῇ τῆς ὑπερκειμένης φύσεως θεωρία (Gregory of Nussa, *De Vita Moses*, H. Musurilo, *Gregorii Nysseni Opera* (GNO), VII/I, Leiden 1964, 83, 6-7) რამეს ესე ყოველი აღესრულოს, მიეახლებს უზემთაესისა მის ბუნებისა ხედვასა (P3,373r,59).

process of contemplation of the supreme nature by a person trying to achieve spiritual perfection. The translator renders the process of moving closer to the realm of mental contemplation by the term გულისკმის-ყოფა (perceiving).<sup>3</sup> The point at which Gregory of Nyssa provides an allegorical explanation of Moses seeing the God's back during the third theophany, i. e. when the Greek θεωρία in its original meaning denotes seeing physically, is translated by Euthymius the Athonite as "seeing" (ბილვა), while in the same sentence when the Greek verb (θεωρέω) stands for seeing mentally, i. e. perceiving history allegorically as a "fable image", the translator decides in favor of the term "perceiving" (გულისკმის-ყოფა) again. We have a similar case with the translation of the Greek ὁράω. In particular, when the original describes physical seeing, i. e. seeing tangible things, the equivalent in the Georgian version has the words "seeing" (ბილვა) or "looking" (ხედვა), and when the author speaks about mental perception and conceptualization of a profound idea concealed in history, the translator goes back to the Georgian equivalent term of "perceiving" (გულისკმის-ყოფა).<sup>4</sup>

When translating Gregory of Nazianzus's 30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> *Orations*, Euthymius the Athonite renders ἡ θεωρία with a single Georgian equivalent "perceiving" (გულისკმის-ყოფა). The rationale again lies in the context: dealing with the divine contemplation and mental seeing leading to the divine cognition, the Georgian translator disposes the Greek term of the meaning of the mundane and translates it as "perceiving" (გულისკმის-ყოფა).<sup>5</sup>

<sup>3</sup> σημαίνει κατὰ τὴν ἡμέτεραν ὑπόληψιν τὸ ὑπερβῆναι τὴν ἐξ αἰσθήσεως γενομένην γνώσιν ἐν τῇ τῶν νοητῶν θεωρίᾳ (VM, 84,2-4) amas moaswawebs, viTar me vhgoneb, viTarmed, romeli uxilavTa maT gulisAmis-yofaTa Sevidodis, uAms, raATA AorcielTa maT saconbelTa mier momavalsa cnobasa da gulisAmis-yofasa Tana-warhAdes (373v, 59).

<sup>4</sup> μετὰ ταύτην ἡ τῶν ὀπισθίων θεωρία ἐλόγώτερόν τι τῷ τῆς ἀναγωγῆς νόμῳ θεωρηθησεται (VM, 112, 5-6) zurgiT kerZoAsa RmrTisa xilvaA keTil ars, raATA igavis saxed gulisAma-vyoT (384v, 84).

<sup>5</sup> λέγεται, μετὰ τῶν προσφόρων τῇ θεωρίᾳ μαρτυριῶν (Gregorie de Nazianze, *Discours*, 27-31 (discours theologiques), Introduction, Texte critique, traduction et notes par P. Gallay, Sources Chretiennes, Les Editionis Du Cerf, Paris 1978, 3. Or. 31, 2, 5-7) თქუმის წამებითა შემსგავსებულთა ამის გულისკმისყოფისათა (Gregory of Nazianzus, 30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> *Orations*, critical apparatuses and technical resources by T. Kurtsikidze (not published) 31. 2. 6).

When discussing synchronous theoretical and practical actions accompanying the striving to perceive the truth, Gregory of Nyssa uses the term *ὑπόληψις* originally meaning, as evidenced from multiple examples in the translation, *thought* (*გულთსობსტყუა*), *recollection* (*მოკონება*), and *meditation* (*სავონებელ*), i. e. lexemes denoting the act of supposing. However, when Gregory of Nyssa argues that the foundation for learning virtues, on the one hand, is the liturgy and, on the other hand, having an appropriate outlook regarding the nature of the Divine, the translator substitutes this ambiguous assumptive term with the synonymous “perceiving” (*გულთსობს-ყოფა*), denoting mental contemplation.<sup>6</sup>

When translating *ὑπόληψις* in Gregory of Nazianzus’s theological *Orations*, Euthymius provides a completely different term as its equivalent.<sup>7</sup> The translator becomes all the more stricter in relation to dogmatic issues and renders *ὑπόληψις* by exceedingly categorical religious expression of *the truth*. In this case, we have to do with is a divergent translation, in which the translator renders the term with a totally different meaning to prevent the reader from a possible incorrect understanding of the dogmate.

A similar trend can be observed in the translation of the term *φαντάζομαι* attested in Nazianzus’s works and meaning theological visualization. Since visualisation in the minds of Georgian readers may evoke an association of subjective imagination, Euthymius substituted it by a lexical unit that is devoid of any subjectivity and suggests “perceiving” (*გულთსობს-ყოფა*) as a Georgian equivalent for *φαντάζομαι*.<sup>8</sup> We come across *ἡ φαντασία*, a noun of the same root, in Gregory of Nyssa’s work when the author contends that the first step in fathoming the truth is to discard falsehood, defining falsehood as an imagination about temporal

<sup>6</sup> τὰς πρεπούσας ὑπολήψεις περὶ τῆς θείας φύσεως ἔχειν (VM 22, 14-16) romelni-igi iynnes swavlani saTnoebisani, romlisa Tavadi ars RmrTismsaxurebaÁ da gulisÁmis-yofaÁ saRmrToÁsa mis bunebisaTÁs (351v, 14).

<sup>7</sup> ἐκ τῶν ἀνθρωπίνων τὸ δυνατὸν λαβὼν τῆς ἡμετέρας ὑπολήψεως (*Or.*, 31, 11, 17-20) kacobrivTa saxeTaganca ipoebis WeSmaritebaÁ (31. 11. 50).

<sup>8</sup> οὐχ ὅς ἐῖρε τὸ πᾶν ... ἀλλ’ ὅς ἐὰν ἄλλου φαντασθῆ πλέον (*Or.*, 30, 17, 13-15) araTu romelmanca pova yovelive saidumloÁ RmrTismetyuelebisaÁ aramed romelmanca umetesad sxuaTa gulisÁma-yos (30. 17. 9). Δαβίδ ἐφαντάσθη πρότερον (*Or.*, 31, 3, 16-17) daviT gulisÁma-yo pirvel (31. 3. 10).

things. In this case, the Georgian translator retains the contextual meaning and renders ἡ φαντασία by the word “dreaming” (ოცნება).<sup>9</sup>

Both Gregory of Nyssa’s and Nazianzus’s works abound with the Greek terms that convey the process of cognizing the infinite and transcendental Divine essence. After correlating the two works with their Georgian versions, it became clear that when translating the Gnoseological vocabulary, Euthymius the Athonite gives preference to the term “perceiving” (გულისწმა-ყოფა).<sup>10</sup> The Georgian translator tries to incorporate in this single and, so to say, safe lexeme all cognitive terms that have the philosophical implication of seeing beyond and that would definitely cause confusion of the untrained Georgian readers, eventually leading to a wrong understanding of the notion. Below we are bringing all the Greek lexical units from both works translated by the Georgian translator as “perceiving” (გულისწმის-ყოფა). However, we decided to highlight several instances: 1. გულისწმის-ყოფა is the sole equivalent of the pertinent Greek term; 2. გულისწმის-ყოფა is one of the equivalents of the Greek term and 3. The Greek word is rendered by a hendiadys of which გულისწმაყოფა is a component, i.e. the instances when Euthymius the Athonite resorts to hendiadyses to convey the depth of the wide cognitive meaning of a particular Greek term. Classifying the terms in this manner would also allow us to examine the solidity of the Georgian equivalents of the Greek lexemes and determine whether Euthymius alters the meaning of one and the same Greek term when translating the works of two different genres.

---

<sup>9</sup> ψευδος γάρ ἐστι φαντασία τις περι τὸ μὴ ὄν ἐγγισομένη τῇ διανοίᾳ, ὡς ὑφεστῶτος τοῦ μὴ ὑπάρχοντος. ἀλήθεια δὲ ἡ τοῦ ὄντος ὄντος ἀσφαλῆς κατανόησις (VM 40, 6-8) rameTu tyuvili ars yovelI ucnebaÁ warmavaI Ta amaT saqmeTaÁ, xolo WeSmarit ars mecnierebaÁ WeSmaritisa mis arisaÁ (357r, 26).

<sup>10</sup> გულისწმის-ყოფა (Abuladze I., Explanatory Dictionary of Old Georgian, Tbilisi 1973: acknowledging, remembering, informing, notifying, feeling, being aware, knowing, looking), (Sulkhan-Saba Orbeliani: it means mental perception and opening up of hearts. Has been described by some as heart’s voice. Heart does not have voice (ჭმა(ა), but can be unlocked and opened ajar, which is called reason), (Melikishvili D., Documented Dictionary of Old Georgian and Old Greek Philosophical and Theological Terms, Tbilisi 2010: understanding, conceptualization, cognition), Z. Sarjeladze’s Dictionary of Old Georgian, Tbilisi 1995 – does not contain this term.

For a better visualization, we designed tables with the Greek terms and their correspondent Georgian versions in the Georgian translations of both Gregory of Nyssa's and Gregory of Nazianzus's works (see tables).

Although a vast majority of Greek cognitive terms are rendered by Euthymius the Athonite based on the same principle and using the same Georgian equivalent, we nevertheless encounter a number of differences in the translations of both Gregory of Nyssa's and Gregory of Nazianzus's works: 1. If the Greek term *θεωρία* in Gregory of Nyssa's *The Life of Moses* has a philosophical as well as a trivial bearing, in Gregory of Nazianzus's work it has a strictly defined and exclusively philosophical meaning of transcendental contemplation; 2. The Georgian version of *ὕποληψις* in Gregory of Nyssa's work is closer to the basic meaning of this word as it is rendered by the Georgian *გულისებობა-ყოფა* (perceiving). In Gregory of Nazianzus's *Orations*, however, we encounter a totally different case with "the truth" appearing as the equivalent of *ὕποληψις*; 3. When translating *φαντάζομαι/ή φαντασία*, on the other hand, Euthymius the Athonite is fully focused on the contents of the original and interprets the original idea correctly considering the readers' interest.

The examination of old Georgian translations of the above semantic units of cognitive terminology allowed us to draw certain conclusions. In particular, it was ascertained that Georgian theological terminology had not yet been strictly defined by Euthymius the Athonite's time. The translator tries to fully convey the depth of the original teaching, while, simultaneously takes into account the interests and intellectual background of the Georgian readers, which should explain why Euthymius tries not to confuse the reader by the polysemy of the Greek lexemes. He is especially strict when translating a dogmatic work and therefore at a point in Nazianzus's work dealing with the Holy Trinity dogmate, a particular Greek term often has one Georgian match instead of being rendered by several equivalents, like in case with the translation of Gregory of Nyssa's exegetical work. As to the fact that the translator renders nearly a two dozens of Greek gnoseological lexemes by a single term – *გულისებობა-ყოფა* (perceiving) – clearly indicates that we are witnessing the tendency to unify diverse Greek lexemes.

Greek Terms the Only Correspondence of Which is *perceiving* (გულისკმის-ყოფა)

Greek Term	Gregory of Nyssa	Gregory of Nazianzus
περίνοια	გულისკმის-ყოფა	გულისკმის-ყოფა
σκοπέω	გულისკმის-ყოფა	გულისკმის-ყოფა
νοοῦμαι	გულისკმის-ყოფა	გულისკმის-ყოფა
διανοέω		გულისკმის-ყოფა
λογίζομαι		გულისკმის-ყოფა
ἐνοοῶ	გულისკმის-ყოფა	
ἐννοια		გულისკმის-ყოფაი
ἀκολουθία	გულისკმის-ყოფა	
διανοητικόν	გულისკმისმყოფელობა	
ὑπονοέω	გულისკმის-ყოფა	გულისკმის-ყოფა

Greek Terms, One of the Correspondence of Which is *perceiving* (გულისკმის-ყოფა)

Greek Term	Gregory of Nyssa	Gregory of Nazianzus
ἐπίγνωσις	ცნობა, მეცნიერება, გულისკმის-ყოფა	მეცნიერებაი
γινώσκω	მეცნიერება, ცნობა, ცოდნა, საცნაურ ქმნა, სმენა, ხილვა, გულისკმის-ყოფა	ცნობა, მეცნიერება,
σημαίνω	მოსწავება, გამოსახვა, გულისკმის-ყოფა	
μανθάνω	გულისკმის-ყოფა, სწავლა, ცნობა,	სწავლა
μεταλαμβάνω	მიცვალება, გულისკმის-ყოფა	მიღება
νοέω	მოგონება, საცნაურ-ყოფა, გულისკმის-ყოფა	გულისკმის-ყოფა
ἐννοέω	მოგონება, გულისკმის-ყოფა	გულისკმის-ყოფა
εἶδω	ცოდნა, გულისკმის-ყოფა	
χαίρω	დატევნა, აღსლვა, მიახლება გულისკმის-ყოფა	შემოკრება, დამკვიდ- რება, დატევა, მიწევნა
ἀπαντάω		წარმართება, გულისკმა-ყოფა
γινώσις	ცნობა, ხედვა, გულისკმის- ყოფაი	მეცნიერებაი, გულისკმის-ყოფაი
συνίμι	ცოდნა, გულისკმის-ყოფა	
κατανόησις	გონება, მეცნიერება, გულისკმის-ყოფაი	მეცნიერება

κατανοία	ცნობა, პოვა, განცდა, ხილვა, პერობა, გულისკმის-ყოფა	
διάνοια	გონება, ძალი, გულისკმის-ყოფა	გონება, გულისკმის-ყოფა
ἐπίγνωσις	ცნობა, მეცნიერება, გულისკმის-ყოფა	მეცნიერება
σημασία	სასწაული, გამოჩინება, გულისკმის-ყოფა	
ἀναφέρω		გულისკმის-ყოფა, მიჩემება
ὄρα	ხილვა, ხედვა, გულისკმის-ყოფა	ხედვა
νόημα	გულისკმის-ყოფა	
νοῦς	აზრი, გულისკმის-ყოფა	გონება

Hendiadys, one of the Component Part of Which is perceiving (გულისკმის-ყოფა)

Greek Term	Gregory of Nyssa	Gregory of Nazianzus
γινώσκω	გულისკმის-ყოფა ცნობად	
σπλέγω		მიწევა გულისკმის-ყოფად
βαδίζω		პერობა გულისკმის-ყოფით
καταίρω		მიწუთომა გულისკმის-ყოფად
γνώσις	1. ცნობა და გულისკმის-ყოფა; 2. ხილვა, ცნობა, მიწუთომა	
γνώριμος		უცხადესი და გულისკმისსაყოფელად ჭეშმარიტი



***Abstract***

The present paper is an attempt to analyze the development of the Georgian theological terminology at its early-stage based on Euthymius the Athonite's translations of two works pertaining to two different genres. Notably, our research will focus on the analysis of the interrelation between Greek Gnoseological terms and Euthymius's corresponding versions based on Gregory of Nazianzus's dogmatic writings – 30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> *Oration*s – and Gregory of Nyssa's exegetical work entitled *The Life of Moses*. A comprehensive study of a particular translation involves an assessment of the original version in terms of the concepts and world-view it conveys, on the one hand, and a textual and philological analysis of the translated version, on the other, lexicological studies constituting one of the most important aspects of the latter. The early-stage translation of the above works into Georgian provides interesting material for observing the formation of the Georgian theological terminology as well as understanding the polysemy of relevant Greek terms.